

PROJECT EVALUATION MATRIX FAI-US 33-5.00 (PID 76938) - JULY 2013

FEASIBLE ALTERNATIVES	NO BUILD	ALTERNATIVE 1-Parclo Interchange (2006 ODOT PREFERRED INTERCHANGE)	ALTERNATIVE 2 Tight Diamond Interchange	ALTERNATIVE 3 SPLIT DIAMOND INTERCHANGE 2013 ODOT PREFERRED ALTERNATIVE
COMPARISON FACTORS				
PURPOSE AND NEED				
Fulfills Purpose and Need	NOT ACHIEVED	ACHIEVED	ACHIEVED	ACHIEVED
ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACTS (RED FLAGS)				
STREAM IMPACTS	N/A	4 crossings total 1,575 feet	3,258 feet (stream relocation included)	600' Three streams
WETLAND IMPACTS	N/A	0.2 acres	0.32 acres	0.56 acres
FLOODWAY/FLOODPLAIN IMPACTS	N/A	0 ACRES/2.0 ACRES	0 ACRES/6.4 ACRES	0 ACRES/ 3.1 ACRES
SECTION 4F IMPACTS (HISTORICAL/RECREATIONAL)	N/A	1 (OHI-653-4)/0	1 (OHI-653-4)/0	1 (OHI-653-4)/0
AGRICULTURAL DISTRICT FARMLAND IMPACTS	N/A	0	0	0
HAZARDOUS WASTE CONCERNS-ENVIRONMENTAL SITE ASSESSMENTS (ESA)	N/A	9 Phase 1 ESA Studies (minimal impact of Industrial Park properties)	13 Phase I ESA Studies	13 Phase I ESA Studies
ENDANGERED SPECIES IMPACTED	N/A	4-Suitable habitat trees for Indiana Bat	5-Suitable habitat trees for Indiana Bat	4- Suitable habitat trees for Indiana Bat
COMMUNITY IMPACTS				
EXPECTED INFRASTRUCTURE IMPACTS All interchange alternatives (Alts. 1,2,and 4) will include: *Cul-de-sac at US33 Lockville Road *Cul-de-sac at Pleasantville Road *Cul-de-sac Carroll-Southern Road	N/A	Extension of High Street Oberle Cul-de-sac Connection to Carroll Northern Road	Extension of High Street Oberle Cul-de-sac Connection to Carroll Northern Road	Extension of High Street and Winchester Road to interchange Extension of Carroll Northern Road to connect to the interchange Winchester Road extension provides access for industrial park directly to interchange
FUTURE LOCAL MAINTENANCE RESPONSIBILITIES	N/A	Extension of High Street Carroll Northern Road connector	Extension of High Street Carroll Northern Road connector	Extension of High Street Carroll Northern Road connector Extension of Winchester Road
TRAVEL/TIME HIGH STREET/MILL STREET TO RR OVERPASS-AM PEAK HIGH STREET/MILL STREE TO RR OVERPASS-PM PEAK	AM PEAK 892.4 SEC. PM PEAK 1333.8 SEC.	AM PEAK-148.9 SECONDS PM PEAK-161.7 SECONDS	AM PEAK-215.1 SECONDS PM PEAK-229.5 SECONDS	AM PEAK-173.2 SECONDS PM PEAK-159.0 SECONDS
RIGHT-OF-WAY				
RIGHT-OF-WAY PURCHASED # OF PARCELS	N/A	40 Parcels	70 Parcels	40 Parcels
DISPLACEMENTS: **COMMERCIAL # OF PARCELS **RESIDENTIAL # OF PARCELS	N/A	1 Commercial 7 Residential	0 Commercial 8 Residential	0 Commercial 1 Residential
AGRICULTURAL LAND ACRES	N/A	50 Acres	40 Acres	40 Acres
ENGINEERING CONSIDERATIONS				
UTILITIES	N/A	Avoidance of Cell Tower/Sub Station	Avoidance of Cell Tower/Sub Station	Avoidance of Cell Tower/Sub Station
MAINTENANCE OF TRAFFIC ON US 33	N/A	MOT will have minimal impact on US 33	US 33 MOT will Utilize proposed entrance and exit ramps to maintain traffic	MOT will have minimal impact on US 33
ACCESS MAINTENANCE OF TRAFFIC ISSUES (OTHER)	N/A	Only access to Industrial Park via Winchester Road via Underpass at Railroad	Industrial Park access possible from both Carroll-Northern Road and Winchester Road	Industrial Park will have direct access to the interchange via the Winchester Rd. extension. The extension is between interchange and existing Winchester Rd. intersection
RAILROAD IMPACTS	N/A	Bridge over railroad; temporary disruption	Relocation of Railroad-New Rail line constructed	Minimal r/w impact to railroad property
US 33 OPERATIONAL ISSUES (WEAVING MOVEMENT) 1) Gore distance between Carroll-Area interchange and Lancaster Bypass 2) Distance between the end of the westbound entrance ramp from the Lancaster Bypass to the beginning of the westbound exit ramp to the Carroll-Area interchange	N/A	1) 4,800 feet 2) 9,000 feet	1) 6,000 feet 2) 7,600 feet	1) 4,100 feet 2) 5,100 feet
COMPARISON OF PROJECT COSTS				
ROADWAY TOTAL	0	\$ 9,900,000	\$12,100,000	\$13,850,000
STRUCTURE TOTAL	-	\$25,000,000	\$ 9,600,000	\$ 9,840,000
RIGHT-OF-WAY	-	\$ 9,000,000	\$11,400,000	\$ 9,500,000
MISCELLANEOUS and 20% CONTINGENCY	-	\$14,900,000	\$11,000,000	\$10,400,000
INFLATION (CONSTRUCTION 2014)	-	\$ 8,700,000	\$ 4,900,000	\$ 5,110,000
TOTAL COST (CONSTRUCTION 2014)	-	\$67,500,000	\$49,000,000	\$48,700,000